



EUROPEAN MEDICINES AGENCY
SCIENCE MEDICINES HEALTH

5 May 2015
EMA/HMPC/572845/2009
Committee on Herbal Medicinal Products (HMPC)

List of references supporting the assessment *Symphytum officinale* L., radix

Final

The European Medicines Agency acknowledges that copies of the underlying works used to produce this monograph were provided for research only with exclusion of any commercial purpose.

Abbott PJ Comfrey: assessing the low-dose health risk. *Med J Aust* 1988; 149:678-682

Aftab K, Shaheen F, Mohammad FV, Noorwala M, Ahmad VU. Phyto-pharmacology of saponins from *Symphytum officinale* L. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 1996; 404:429-442

Ahmad VU, Noorwala M, Mohammad FV, Sener B, Gilani AH, Aftab K. Symphytoxide A, a triterpenoid saponin from the roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Phytochemistry* 1993; 32:1003-1006

Anderson P, McLean AEM. Comfrey and liver damage. *Hum Toxicol* 1989; 9:68-69

Andres P, Brenneisen R, Clerc JT. Relating antiphlogistic efficacy of dermatics containing extracts of *Symphytum officinale* to chemical profiles. *Planta Med* 1989; 55:643-44

Andres R, Bourquin D, Brenneisen R, Clerc JT. The antiphlogistic efficacy of dermatics containing pyrrolizidine alkaloid-free extracts of *Symphytum officinale*. *Planta Med* 1990; 56:664

Bach N, Thung SN, Schaffner F. Comfrey herb tea-induced hepatic veno-occlusive disease *Am J Med* 1989; 87(1):97-99

Barceloux DG Medical Toxicology of Natural Substances – Foods, Fungi, Medicinal Herbs, Plants and Venomous Animals. Wiley, Hoboken, New Jersey, 2008. 449-457

Barnes J, Anderson LA, Phillipson JD. Herbal Medicines. 3rd Edition. Pharmaceutical Press, London, 2007. 188-190

Behninger C, Abel G, Röder E, Neuberger V, Göggelmann W. Wirkung eines Alkaloidextraktes von *Symphytum officinale* auf menschliche Lymphocytenkulturen. *Planta Med* 1989; 55:518-522

Benedek B, Ziegler A, Ottersbach P. Absence of Mutagenic Effects of a particular *Symphytum officinale* L. liquid extract in the Bacterial Reverse Mutation Assay. *Phytother Res* 2010; 24:466-468



- BGA, 1992. Bekanntmachung über die Zulassung und Registrierung von Arzneimitteln vom 05. Juni 1992 Abwehr von Arzneimitteln - Stufe II, hier: Arzneimittel, die Pyrrolizidin-Alkaloide mit einem 1,2-ungesättigtem Necin-Gerüst enthalten. BAnz 111: 4805
- Blumenthal M, Busse WR, Goldberg A, Gruenwald J, Hall T, Riggins W, Rister R, Klein S (editors). *The Complete German Commission E Monographs; Therapeutic Guide to Herbal Medicines*; The American Botanical Council, Austin, Texas, 1998. 116
- Brauchli J, Lüthy J, Zweifel U, Schlatter C. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids from *Symphytum officinale* L. and their percutaneous absorption in rats. *Experientia* 1982; 38:1085-1087
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1974. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1971. *Symphytum* monograph
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1983. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1983. *Symphytum* root monograph pp 202-203
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1996. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1996. 62-63
- Bruneton J. Pharmacognosy, Phytochemistry, Medicinal Plants. 2nd Edition. Lavoisier Publishing Inc., Paris, 1999, 839-841
- Chou MW, Fu PP. Formation of DHP-derived DNA adducts in vivo from dietary supplements and chinese herbal plant extracts containing carcinogenic pyrrolizidine alkaloids. *Toxicol Ind Health* 2006; 22:321-327
- Chrubasik S. Effectiveness of *Symphytum officinale* (comfrey root) extract ointment in painful knee osteoarthritis. Commentary. *Focus on Alternative and Complementary Therapies* 2007; 12:177-178
- CHMP (2008). Guideline on risk assessment of medicinal products on human reproduction and lactation: from data to labelling" (EMA/CHMP/203927/2005)
- http://www.ema.europa.eu/docs/en_GB/document_library/Scientific_guideline/2009/09/WC500003307.pdf
- Couet CE, Crews C, Hanley AB. Analysis, separation, and bioassay of pyrrolizidine alkaloids from comfrey (*Symphytum officinale*). *Nat Toxins* 1996; 4:163-167
- Coulombe RA. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids in foods. *Adv Food Nutr Res* 2003; 45:61-99
- CPMP (1992). Committee for Proprietary Medicinal Products "Listing of herbs and herbal derivatives withdrawn for safety reasons - Herbal drugs with serious risks"
- http://www.ema.europa.eu/docs/en_GB/document_library/Other/2011/09/WC500111303.pdf
- Cupp MJ. Toxicology and Clinical Pharmacology of Herbal Products. Humana Press, Totowa, New Jersey, 2000. 203-214
- D'Anchise BM, Giannetti B. Comfrey extract ointment in comparison to diclofenac gel in the treatment of acute unilateral ankle sprains (distorsions). *Drug Research* 2007; 57:712-716
- De Smet PAGM, Keller K, Hänsel R, Chandler RF (Eds.). Adverse Effects of Herbal Drugs. Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg, 1992. 194-205, 220-222
- Furmanowa M, Guzewska J, Beldowska B. Mutagenic effects of aqueous extracts of *Symphytum officinale* L. and of its alkaloidal fractions. *J Appl Toxicol* 1983; 3:127-130

Garrett BJ, Cheeke PR, Miranda CL, Goeger DE, Buhler DR. Consumption of poisonous plants (*Senecio jacobaea*, *Symphytum officinale*, *Pteridium aquilinum*, *Hypericum perforatum*) by rats: chronic toxicity, mineral metabolism, and hepatic drug-metabolizing enzymes. *Toxicol Lett* 1982; 10:183-188

Giannetti BM, Staiger C, Bulitta M, Predel HG. Efficacy and safety of a Comfrey root extract ointment in the treatment of acute upper or low back pain: results of a double-blind, randomised, placebo-controlled, multi-centre trial. *Br J Sports Med* 2010; 44(9):637-641

Goldman RS, de Freitas PCD, Oga S. Wound healing and analgesic effect of crude extracts of *Symphytum officinale* in rats. *Fitoterapia* 1985; 56:323-329

Gomes MF, de Oliveira Massoco C, Xavier JG, Bonamin LV. Comfrey (*Symphytum officinale* L.) and Experimental Hepatic Carcinogenesis: A Short-term Carcinogenesis Model Study. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*. 2010; 7(2):197-202

Gracza L, Koch H, Löffler E. Biochemical-pharmacologic studies of medicinal plants. 1. Isolation of rosmarinic acid from *Symphytum officinale* L. and its anti-inflammatory activity in an in vitro model. *Arch. Pharm. (Weinheim)* 1985; 318:1090-1095

Grube B, Grünwald J, Krug L, Staiger C. Efficacy of a comfrey root (*Symphyti offic. radix*) extract ointment in the treatment of patients with painful osteoarthritis of the knee: Results of a double-blind, randomised, bicenter, placebo-controlled trial. *Phytomedicine* 2007; 14:2-10

Gruenwald J, Brendler, T, Jaenicke C (editors). PDR for Herbal Medicines. 4th Edition. Thomson Healthcare Inc., Montvale, New Jersey, 2000, 212-214

Guo L, Mei N, Dial S, Fuscoe J, Chen T. Comparison of gene expression profiles altered by comfrey and riddelliine in rat liver. *BMC Bioinformatics*. 2007; 8 (Suppl. 7):S22

Hänsel R, Sticher O. *Pharmakognosie – Phytopharmazie*. 7th Edition. Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, 2004. 915-920, 1138

Hiermann A, Writzel M. Antiphlogistic glycopeptide from the roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Pharmaceutical and Pharmacological Letters* 1998; 8:154-157

Hirono I, Masanobu H, Fujii M, Shin M, Matsubara N, Nakayama M, Furuya T, Hikichi M, Takanashi H, Uchida E, Hosaka S, Ueno I. Induction of hepatic tumors in rats by senkirkine and symphytine. *J Natl Cancer Inst* 1978b; 63:469-471

Hirono I, Mori H, Haga M. Carcinogenic activity of *Symphytum officinale*. *J Natl Cancer Inst* 1978a; 61:865-869

HMPC (2014). Public statement on the use of herbal medicinal products containing toxic, unsaturated pyrrolizidine alkaloids (PAs) (EMA/HMPC/893108/2011)

http://www.ema.europa.eu/docs/en_GB/document_library/Public_statement/2014/12/WC500179559.pdf

Kern W, Roth HJ, Schmid W. Hagers Handbuch der Pharmazeutischen Praxis. Chemikalien und Drogen Teil B: R-S. 4th edition Vol 6. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York 1979, 706-708

Koll R, Buhr M, Dieter R, Pabst H, Predel HG, Petrowicz O, Giannetti B, Klingenburg S, Staiger C. Efficacy and tolerance of a comfrey root extract (Extr. Rad. Symphyti) in the treatment of ankle distortions: results of a multicenter, randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blind study. *Phytomedicine*. 2004; 11:470-477

- Koll R, Klingenburg S. Therapeutische Eigenschaften und Verträglichkeit topischer Beinwellzubereitungen. Ergebnisse einer Beobachtungsstudie an Patienten. *Fortschr Med* 2002; 120:1-9
- Lafranconi WM, Huxtable RJ. Hepatic metabolism and pulmonary toxicity of monocrotaline using isolated perfused liver and lung. *Biochem Pharmacol* 1984; 33:2479-2484
- Lenghel V, Radu DL, Chirilă P, Olinescu A. The influence of some vegetable extracts on the in vitro adherence of mouse and human lymphocytes to nylon fibers. *Roum Arch Microbiol Immunol* 1995; 54:15-30
- Lohmann K, Reiningger E, Bauer R. Screening of European anti-inflammatory herbal drugs for inhibition of cyclooxygenase-1 and -2. *Phytomedicine* 2000; 7 (Suppl. 2):99
- Longe JL (editor). The Gale Encyclopedia of Alternative Medicine. 2nd Edition, Thomson Gale, Michigan: Gale Group, 2005.vol 1 pp. 526-527
- McLean EK. The toxic actions of pyrrolizidine (*Senecio*) alkaloids. *Pharmacological Review* 1970; 22:429-83
- Mei N, Guo L, Fu PP, Heflich RH, Chen T. Mutagenicity of comfrey (*Symphytum officinale*) in rat liver. *British Journal of Cancer* 2005; 92:873-875
- Mei N, Guo L, Zhang L, Shi L, Sun YA, Fung C, Moland CL, Dial SL, Fuscoe JC, Chen T. Analysis of gene expression changes in relation to toxicity and tumorigenesis in the livers of Big Blue transgenic rats fed comfrey (*Symphytum officinale*). *BMC Bioinformatics* 2006; 7 (Suppl 2):S16
- Mohammad FV, Noorwlw M, Ahmad VU, Sener B. Bisdesmosidic Triterpenoidal Saponins from the Roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Planta Med* 1995; 61:94
- Predel HG, Giannetti B, Koll R, Bulitta M, Staiger C. Efficacy of a Comfrey root extract ointment in comparison to a Diclofenac gel in the treatment of ankle distortions: Results of an observer-blind, randomized, multicenter study. *Phytomedicine* 2005; 12:707-714
- Ridker PM, Ohkuma S, McDermott WV, Trey C, Huxtable RJ. Hepatic venoocclusive disease associated with the consumption of pyrrolizidine-containing dietary supplements. *Gastroenterology* 1985; 88:1050-1054
- Ritschel WA, Starzacher A, Sabouni A, Hussain AS, Koch HP. Percutaneous absorption of rosmarinic acid in the rat. *Methods Find Exp Clin Pharmacol* 1989; 11:345-352
- Rode D. Comfrey toxicity revisited. *TRENDS in Pharmacological Sciences* 2002; 23:497-499
- Roman GP, Neagu E, Moroeanu V, Radu GL. Concentration of *Symphytum officinale* extracts with cytostatic activity by tangential flow ultrafiltration. *Romanian Biotechnological Letters* 2008; 13:4008-4013
- Schaefer C, Peters PWJ, Miller RK (editors). Drugs During Pregnancy and Lactation. 2nd edition. Academic Press/Elsevier, London, 2007. 772
- Schmidtke-Schrezenmeier G, Reck R, Gerster G. Behandlung der nichtaktivierten Gonarthrose - Besserung durch ein Phytotherapeutikum. *Therapiewoche* 1992; 42:1322-1325
- Staiger C, Wegener T. Beinwell in der Therapie stumpfer Traumen: Anwendung bei Kindern. *Zeitschrift für Phytotherapie* 2008; 29:58-64
- Stickel F, Seitz HK. The efficacy and safety of comfrey. *Publ Health Nutrition* 2000; 3:501-508

Tutin TG, Heywood VH, Burges NA, Moore DM, Valentine DH, Walters SM, Webb DA (ed.). *Flora Europaea*. University Press, Cambridge, 1992

Van den Dungen F, Beukelman CJ, Van den Berg AJJ, Quarles van Ufford HC, Van Dijk H, Labadie RP. High molecular weight complement inhibitors of *Symphytum officinale*. *Clin. Exp. Immunol.* 1991; 86 (Suppl. 1):3

Weston CFM, Cooper BT, Davies JD, Levine DF. Veno-occlusive disease of the liver secondary to digestion of comfrey. *British Medical Journal* 1987; 295:183

White RD, Krumperman PH, Cheeke PR, Buhler DR. An evaluation of acetone extracts from six plants in the Ames mutagenicity test *Toxicol Lett.* 1983; 15:25-31

References assessed but not cited in the Assessment Report

COT (2008). COT Statement on Pyrrolizidine Alkaloids in Food. Committee on toxicity of chemicals in food, consumer products and the environment. cot.food.gov.uk/pdfs/cotstatementpa200806.pdf [assessed 01.08.2011]

EFSA (2011), Scientific Opinion on Pyrrolizidine alkaloids in food and feed. EFSA Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain (CONTAM). *EFSA Journal* 9(11): 2406 [134 pp.] Available online: www.efsa.europa.eu/efsajournal

HMPC (2007) Guideline on the assessment of genotoxic constituents of herbal substance/preparations (EMA/HMPC/107079/2007)
http://www.ema.europa.eu/docs/en_GB/document_library/Scientific_guideline/2009/09/WC500003569.pdf

Stamford IF, Tavares IA. The effect of an aqueous extract of comfrey on prostaglandin synthesis by rat isolated stomach. *J Pharm Pharmacol* 1983; 35:816-817

Yeong ML, Clark SP, Waring JM, Wilson RD, Wakefield SJ. The effects of comfrey derived pyrrolizidine alkaloids on rat liver. *Pathology.* 1991; 23:35-8

Yeong ML, Wakefield SJ, Ford HC. Hepatocyte membrane injury and bleb formation following low dose comfrey toxicity in rats. *Int J Exp Pathol.* 1993; 74:211-7